Exchanges on the Essential: The Libermann-Lairé Correspondence

Paul Coulon C.S.Sp.

Follow this and additional works at: https://dsc.duq.edu/spiritan-horizons

Part of the Catholic Studies Commons

Recommended Citation


This Wellsprings is brought to you for free and open access by Duquesne Scholarship Collection. It has been accepted for inclusion in Spiritan Horizons by an authorized editor of Duquesne Scholarship Collection.
Exchanges on the Essential: The Libermann-Lairé Correspondence

Libermann is not an “author” who is writing a “work.” He is not a spiritual writer composing tracts intended for publication to be read, perhaps, by strangers, intellectual disciples of a master thinker or spiritual guide. What must be emphasized is the concrete, interpersonal nature of Libermann’s writings: they are essentially letters to individuals or specific communities (1,800 letters). By definition occasional writings, these letters, in order to be considered valid historical documents require basic textual treatment: identifying the recipient and relying on that person’s letter as much as possible (since the letter in front of us is the response that Libermann wrote to him or her).

These elementary principles of historical reading—which consist of taking into account the literary genre, the social context [Sitz-im-Leben], the text’s recipients, its date, the very structure of the text, which cannot be carved into slices of meaning when it is the whole that makes meaning—these have not always been applied in the past. The early Libermann is not the superior general of 1850; one doesn’t write the same thing when giving spiritual advice to a scrupulous seminarian or a good-time Charlie, or to a nun or a nuncio or the Minister of the Navy.

I would like to apply these reading principles to a single letter (but what a famous and important one!) that Libermann wrote to Mr. Lairé, dated May 8, 1851. It is in response to Lairé’s letter from St. Marie of The Gambia, March 7, 1851.

Who was Charles Lairé?

Charles Marie Lairé was born January 12, 1826 in Murtin, a small French village 14 km. from Mézières (Aisne), in the diocese of Reims. His personnel file in the archives contains a series of testimonials about him and a packet of letters written to his family in his youth. His father was a schoolteacher. The village priest, Abbé Migeon, tells us that Lairé’s health was fragile from birth and that his intention to become a priest dates back to his early childhood. When he was twelve, he entered the diocesan secondary school. He completed his advanced seminary study in Reims.

A rough draft most likely dashed off during his seminary days contains Christian counsel that he offered to his sister Pauline. The piety it manifests is intensely Christocentric: “Tell
Jesus-Christ all your troubles, ask him for his light and especially for the strength to follow the path of righteousness [...] Read the Bible often, even if it is only a few verses in secret." All the testimonials also highlight the intensity of his devotion to Mary.

Charles entered the novitiate of the missionary society of the Sacred Heart of Mary in La Neuville (Amiens) in the fall of 1847. He was ordained deacon in Amiens on June 17, 1848 and made his consecration in the Congregation of the Holy Spirit and the Sacred Heart of Mary at Notre Dame du Gard on February 2, 1849.

On February 17, 1849 he embarked for Toulon aboard the Achéron, a government steamship, with Bishops Bessieux and Kobès, eight confreres (priests and brothers), and the first six Sisters of Castres to leave for Africa. Upon arrival in Dakar, he was ordained a priest on April 7, 1849. He would occupy several posts in the two years that followed, including a period in Gorée. He was also sent to St. Marie of The Gambia (Bathurst).

Charles Lairé writes to Libermann on March 7, 1851

Mgr. Kobès—the youngest bishop in Christendom—was just ending his twenty-ninth year when he arrived in Dakar. The young Apostolic Vicar had difficulty adapting to Dakar: he realized he would have little influence on the Muslim population and that it would be better to turn his attention to the pagans of the coast who were moreover less contaminated by European vices. He had his heart set on St. Marie of The Gambia.

It was precisely on the subject of St. Marie of The Gambia that Charles Marie Lairé wrote a four-page letter to Fr. Libermann on March 7, 1851 as he was preparing to once again change posts, having been named to Grand-Bassam. A copy of the letter can be found below. The numbers preceding the points addressed in the text are Lairé’s.

Note the tone of the letter: very simple and very free, it is more the letter of a disciple confiding in his beloved master than that of an inferior addressing his administrative superior. The spiritual quest appears intense: without a doubt it conveys the strong desires and evangelical spirit that Libermann tried to inspire in the hearts and lives of the young people in training at Amiens.

The Latin reference by Mr. Lairé to the words of the Sacred Congregation of the Propaganda is particularly interesting. It shows what fed the missiological training provided under
Horizons
Libermann’s influence: the 1845 Instruction *Neminem Profecto* of the Propaganda but also all the other preceding texts in the great tradition of the Society of the Foreign Missions of Paris, which Libermann would have known about through his friend Mgr. Luquet.\(^7\)

The Letter from Mr. Lairé to Libermann\(^8\)

St. Marie of The Gambia, March 7, 1851
Very Reverend Father and Superior,

1 – I wrote you several lines on four different occasions two weeks ago despite the poor state of health I was in; I was ashamed to have waited so long to send you my news despite my desire to do so. And yet that small journal is irrelevant now, seeing how various circumstances have changed and I would no longer dare send it to you. Monsignor\(^9\) is recovered and will be able to write you himself via the English steamship whose departure has been postponed.

2 – What can I tell you at this moment? In a few hours I will be leaving St. Marie of The Gambia for Gorée to find the Rusé which should not yet have left, in order to make my way from there to Gr. Bassam where Mgr is sending me as superior; Brother Charles\(^10\) is to accompany me. There I will find Mr. Bourget\(^11\) and Mr. Duret.\(^12\) May God bless the intention of my Bishop and may he use it for his glory. I assure you that it is pleasing that I go over there; I’ve moved so much at this point, always in a precarious position, sometimes a bit false! At last the good Lord wants to give me, firmly tie me I think, to a patch of the poor heathen vine. There the weeds to tear out are not the smallest, nor the labors [efforts]\(^13\) that will be required the least amount of patience and perseverance. It will end up, I think, diminishing this last bit of avidity, this too great or too impatient desire for the good which consumes me; and will also deliver me completely from all the inconstancy of character, of all the remaining

3- influence that sensation still holds on the young part of our soul that must alone see and guide and love . . . oh! I feel that God is purifying [me] my soul more and more and all its faculties in every way, and that he transforms it more every day in the purity and the strength of his love, in the light of only his faith and in the repose of his will, accomplished over and above all sensitivity, consolation, above all pettiness of vanity, human respect, self-love, self-seeking in all things . . . seeing things only like God, wanting the good in us and in others only like Jesus, no more than Jesus . . . , being a person solidly grounded on the
principles of Jesus and his Holy Church, but with all gentleness in relations with men of this world. Oh! pray, dearest Father and superior, pray. I count on the paternal kindness of your heart for my poverty; pray that God saves me no longer as a child and that I no longer serve him as a child either . . . I am ashamed to not yet have truly and concretely let myself go, to not have thrown myself headlong into the hands of his will / resting softly in the confidence that his mercy will work its holy will in me, in the midst of miserable states of body and soul, in the midst of darkness of soul [and] …

I’m terrified when I think of these words of the Sacred Congreg. of the Propag. for missionaries. . . non mediocri caritate ac prudentia insignitas . . . sed diuturnus rerum usus et experientia . . . probaverit14; but I count above all on your prayers, and those of the few who love the glory of the divine Savior and who love me on earth and even in heaven. Omnia possum in eo qui . . .15

4 – I will tell you no more about things here. . . Msgr and Mr. Duby16 are writing you yourselves. . . May the good Lord preserve you a long time in our love . . . I am very happy that Mr. Le Vavasseur17 has come to share our burden. Mr. Schwindenhammer18 delighted me with his too brief note – I had already heard some of the missionaries complain that our brothers in France would not reply to our letters... etc. . . . I will let you judge.

I’ve forgotten none of these Messieurs from the Paris house . . . , praying that God’s will be totally done for our poor little Congregation and for the novitiate especially. Adieu! in union with Jesus Christ and Mary, in osculo sancto,19

Your servant and son in Our Lord
c.m. Lairé
missionary H.S. et S. H. Mary

P.S. My sister will be buying several things with her own money for the community of Grand Bassam; I have the permission of His Lordship; I asked her to speak to Mr. Briot,20 if . . .

P.S. Abbé Moussa21 is doing a great deal of good here; he seems to have a particular grace for explaining the religion to his poor fellow countrymen. I’ve listened to him for a month now with great pleasure. I have not reread [this letter].22

Libermann’s Response to Lairé

Libermann’s response to Lairé draws its significance from the moment in which he wrote it, in the biblical sense of moment
“God’s moment” constitutes one of the main categories in Libermann’s thought and missionary strategy. In 1851, the development of the Congregation and its missionary engagements was not without creating some tensions in its midst. An exceptionally long letter (written over a period of eight mornings) that Libermann wrote to Mgr. Kobès between April 21 and May 3, 1851, bears witness to this fact. In it, he takes up the defense of Ignace Schwindenhammer, his counselor, strongly criticized by the missionaries, and responds to several fears they expressed from the field.

Libermann is worried about the unity of the institute and the spiritual quality of its members. Already between the 22nd and 24th of the preceding February, he had written a series of four letters to the missionaries in Mauritius in which he insisted on the religious life, on fidelity to the Rule and to the life of the community in the whirlwind of apostolic life.

On his return to Notre Dame du Gard (the novitiate and theology) where he remained from March 9 through Holy Monday April 14, 1851, Libermann began work on drafting Instructions to Missionaries. A major text that he surely intended as his spiritual testament, it cost him great effort and would remain unfinished after he stopped writing it in July 1851.

Libermann felt the need to re-center everything on the essential: that is why he wrote the Instructions. Fortunately, we have a sort of summary of that essential in the letter that he wrote during the same period, May 8, 1851, to M. Lairé, in response to the latter’s letter of March 7th.

Libermann’s Text

[The cross-references to the text published in Notes et Documents XIII, p. 142-146 and the numbered lines in Coulon’s text have in large part been omitted. The translation below is taken from A Spiritan Anthology, 322-326 (Editor)].

Here is the outline of the letter:

- Introduction: (lines 1 – 11)
- I – Holiness, only source of Mission (lines 12 – 52)
- II – The Spirit of Jesus and its fruits in the life of the apostle (lines 53 – 91)
- III – How to conduct oneself towards one’s brothers when one is a superior of the community (lines 92 – 107)
Paris, 8th May 1851

My very dear Confrere,

In your letter of 7th March, which, like all your letters, gave me great pleasure, you stated that you were ashamed of having waited so long before writing to me. If you have reason for blaming yourself, I also ought to feel a similar compunction because of my own delay in replying. So we can both make good resolutions! We shall change our ways and no longer have reason to blush with embarrassment.

So now you are in Grand Bassam. You will find a rather difficult people there whose conversion, it seems, could take some time. Your most important preaching will be your holy life and the good example that you give and God will send his grace to these poor people who are preyed on by the devil.

The people of Africa do not need and will not be converted by the efforts of clever and capable missionaries: it is the holiness and the sacrifice of their priests that will be the means of their salvation. Blindness and the spirit of Satan are still too much rooted in those peoples and the curse of their father still leaves its mark on them. They can only be saved by your trials, united to the sufferings of Jesus Christ; that alone can expiate these abominable sins. The missionaries must possess a holiness which draws down upon the Africans the all-powerful and merciful merits of Jesus to wash away God’s curse from them.

Be holy yourself and encourage your confreres to be holy. On this depends the salvation of these unfortunate people for whom you suffer and sacrifice yourself. Your trials and pains will remain futile if they are not sanctified by your whole way of life. It is not enough simply to offer your sufferings to God or even to offer your whole life for the salvation of souls; such an offering is useful for yourself and will obtain the forgiveness of your own faults. But if God’s mercy depends on your sanctity to bring about your own pardon, and there is not enough holiness in you to make up for your own sins, how will your work and sacrifices be enough to save others?

If we do not have God’s holiness in our way of living, if his sanctity does not eliminate, remove, or at least keep under control all our faults and imperfections, how can he possibly hear the prayers which we offer for the people he has asked us
to save? How then will our sacrifices bear fruit in our apostolate? These sacrifices would always be tainted by our natural habits, faults and imperfections. As a result, there will be very little left to attract God’s mercy down on the people.

It is my greatest wish that all my beloved confreres should feel as strongly as I do about the holiness necessary for our missionaries in Africa. Be holy as Jesus was holy; there is no other way to redeem and sanctify souls.

May the spirit of Jesus inspire your actions. May he inspire all your feelings and deaden, or at least moderate, the impetuosity of your mind and all your tendencies to be harsh and unyielding. In short, may he control whatever is passionate and unruly in you. May he guide all your feelings, and direct all your emotions. May he grant you the gentleness and humility of which he has given you such a perfect example. How important are humility and gentleness and how few people possess these virtues! They are very precious and are the direct fruits of true and perfect love, demanding as they do a very high degree of interior self-denial, docility, and submission to God. If we want to obtain them, then all the inflexibility of our wills and all the confidence in ourselves and in our own ideas will have to disappear and be destroyed. A missionary who has the virtues of humility and gentleness deeply embedded in his soul, who allows them to affect his interior habits and outward actions, is truly made holy by the Spirit of God. But the one who lacks those great sanctifying virtues is stunted so far as Christ’s apostolate is concerned. Even if he is as zealous as St. Paul or St. Francis Xavier, he is still lacking any solid foundation on which to build. The spirit of Jesus cannot permeate him and most of the time it is replaced by the missionary’s own spirit, and sometimes even by the spirit of darkness.

However, my dear confrere, I don’t know why I am spending so much time on these details, because I know that you are working with all your strength to put the commands of our Lord into practice, “discite a me (learn of me).”31 I have no doubt that his grace is working powerfully in your soul to give you those two holy virtues.

As regards your relations with your confreres, act with gentleness, affection, moderation, simplicity and confidence. Bear their faults with love and patience. Console them in their troubles and, as much as possible, support them in their temptations. Preserve among them peace, gentleness, charity, and perfect harmony. Our Lord will live among us if we are truly united in his holy Name; but if we have no cohesion among ourselves, he will not be present and will not give us his blessings.
Keep the Rule faithfully. It is the only way of preserving fervor and is a sure guarantee against laxity. Without fidelity to the Rule, it is impossible to avoid becoming lukewarm; so try your best to ensure that the community in your charge follows the Rule as closely as possible.

I am still trying to find out which confrere in France is not being careful to reply to the letters he receives from you in Guinea. They assure me here that they have answered all the letters they have received from West Africa. All of us would like to receive lots of letters from you and we promise to be very prompt in replying to them. In fact, I have heard the complaint that the dear confreres in West Africa have forgotten all about those at home and don't write to them anymore! So please urge the Fathers and Brothers not to neglect the confreres in Europe who love them tenderly and who want to hear from them as often as possible. Ask them to write to one confrere and then another. In that way the holy charity that ought to unite us in Jesus and Mary will be perfect and God will bless us.

Goodbye for now, my dear confrere.

Yours in Jesus and Mary,
F. Libermann, superior

Commentary

From the fullness of the heart the mouth speaks (Matt 12:34), so does Libermann's pen write! After an introduction (1-11) full of tact in which the superior declares himself to be as ashamed as his correspondent to have written so infrequently, Libermann pours out his feelings in a long fiery river on the necessity of holiness, the only source of mission (12-52); not an abstract source, but a source that bears a Name, that of Jesus, whose spirit (and Spirit) drives the life of the apostle (53-91). Judging, moreover, that he let himself get carried away by considerations of passionate concern to him, Libermann recognizes that he is preaching to the converted. M. Lairé's letter, to which he is responding, was, as we have seen, full of the same spiritual fervor.

A certain number of themes introduced in Libermann's letter may be surprising and require some contextual explanation regarding their content as well as their form. To speak of the clutches of the demon (17-18) or the spirit of Satan (21-22) with regards to Africa inevitably surprises today's reader raised on Vatican II and the dialogue advocated by recent popes and synods of Africa concerning traditional African religions.

In order to understand Libermann's letter, it is necessary to refer to the rather restrictive theology of salvation that still
prevailed in France at the beginning of the 19th century. Elisabeth Germain has shed significant light on “the catechism of salvation in Restoration France,” based on analysis of catechisms used in various French dioceses at that time. Of course it is taught that God wants all men to be saved, but few are, even among Catholics, so what is to be said about the others? The adage, *extra ecclesiam nulla salus* is strictly interpreted by the catechisms:

- Can one be saved outside the Church?
- No, for outside the Church, no salvation.
- Why? –Because he who does not have the Church as his mother, cannot have God as his Father.
- Who are those who are outside the Church?
- They are the infidels, heretics, schismatics, apostates, and the excommunicated.

Similarly for another theme that recurs several times in this letter: “the curse of his father” that rests on Africa (22-23 and 27) referring to what was a commonplace of the period, *the curse of Ham*, in reference to the story in the book of Genesis (Gen 9:20-27). A legend of uncertain origin had it that Africans were the cursed descendants of Ham, son of Noah, who had mocked his drunk and naked father . . . There, too, Joseph Lécuyer has shown that on this point Libermann was simply following a stereotype of the theology of his time, but that his more elaborated personal thought, for example in the great *Memorandum* of 1846 to the Propaganda, is more nuanced and resolutely optimistic: “These men are made in the image of God like others and are disposed to receiving the treasure of the faith that they don’t know.”

The tone of the letter to Mr. Lairé in its pessimistic and provocative elements (but they are not the only ones!) can be explained by the precise historical juncture in which Libermann was situated. In 1851 he better ascertains the immensity of the challenge represented by the evangelization of Africa; he knows all the human losses already incurred and he gives them a resolutely biblical reading: it is a matter of a battle against the Enemy (Matt 13:25, 39), the eschatological combat that the apostle Paul (Eph 6:10-17) and the Apocalypse (Revelation 20) speak of in terms of a cosmic confrontation.

It is for this battle of faith that Libermann wants to arm his missionaries. The lofty instruction that resonates throughout the entire letter (and the *Instructions to Missionaries*) is: *Be Holy*. Deep in the heart of Libermann, son of Israel, it is the commandment of Leviticus that resounds: “Be holy, for I am holy” (Lev 19:2; 20: 26). But the Jew turned disciple of Jesus is more specific:
“Be therefore holy as Jesus was holy; it is the one and only way to redeem, to sanctify souls.” It is in this “as” that the missionary vocation resides. The apostle Peter, in his discourse of Acts 3, epitomizes the mystery of salvation in the putting to death of the Holy One, Jesus, Servant that God resuscitated from the dead so that by his Name healing would be restored to every man as to the cripple at the temple gate called Beautiful (Acts 3:13-26).

Only the reference to the Paschal mystery (death and resurrection of Jesus) allows us to understand Libermann’s insistence on sacrifice(s), sufferings. In fact, sacrifices and sufferings are not valued for their own sake; it is not a question of dolorism but of “pains united to those of Jesus.” It is not man that saves the world, it is not the missionary who saves Africa, it is God who in Christ saves the world by the scandal of the Cross (1 Cor 1:22-23). The immolation that Libermann speaks of is participation in Christ’s sacrifice of love.

More than a vicarious redemptive suffering, the victim spirituality that would become widespread at the end of the 19th century, Libermann’s inner movement is akin to the writings of P. de Condren and M. Olier on the sacrifice of Christ continued in that of Christians. Beyond the vocabulary, to our eyes dated, it is the meditation on the Mystery of Christ according to St. Paul that is being offered here.

That M. Lairé was filled with this pascal spirituality of identification with the dead and resuscitated Jesus was dazzlingly apparent in his last letter to reach us, written to his bishop, Mgr Kobès, only minutes before his death . . .

In Conclusion: M. Lairé’s Final Letter

M. Lairé would die on November 25, 1852 in a yellow fever and typhoid epidemic. His companion, Brother Charles, was the sole witness to his efforts to scribble a final letter to his bishop, a testament of his missionary life, moments before passing away. In a few lines, we find in this letter the essence of M. Lairé’s inner feelings towards his mission and his imminent death, pure echo of the missionary instructions received from Libermann.

And yet, be careful! M. Lairé wasn’t content to be inwardly holy and to die at age twenty-six! Lairé and his companions approached the establishment of the mission at Grand-Bassam with great earnestness. Through the letters sent to his bishop, to Libermann, and his fellow missionaries, we see Lairé apply himself to the study of several languages, compile a dictionary, visit villages, make friends with the people...
open the first school in Côte d’Ivoire, the beginnings of a future secondary school. His aim from the start was the formation of a native clergy in accordance with the Propaganda guidelines (*Neminem Profecto*). He drew plans to go settle further in the interior, far from the European and commercial tumult of the coast . . . In short, the letters of someone who thought, with Libermann, that a living missionary is worth more than a dead one, who overflowed with the spirit of enterprise and love for Africans . . . His last letter can thus be read with emotion, for it is neither an exercise in piety nor an exercise in style, but a pure Eucharistic offering with Christ for the glory of God and the salvation of the world. It is with this letter that we will conclude this article.

> St. Jacques of Grand Bassam being tied to the Cross of Jesus and Mary on my bed of sorrow, October 25, 1852. […] I wish only one thing and that is that my brothers benefit [from my death] by seeing clearly like me that God wants to appear alone in his work, without all the industry nor the will of the flesh, nor the will and force of the natural spirit, in order that he may be praised before the angels and his saints […] My love to you all . . . I can’t go on.

> Your child and brother, c.m. Lairé, m.ap.

_Paul Coulon, C.S.Sp._

_Paris_

**Endnotes**


2In Libermann’s time, according to French and Sulpician tradition, a lay ecclesiastic was called Mr. [*Monsieur*]. The title of _Father_ for priests became customary in the order when it moved to public religious (and no longer simply private) vows in 1855 (the first _public_ religious profession was August 26, 1855).

3« Souvenir à ma chère Pauline » [Reminder to my dear Pauline] (Arch. CSSp, Dossier personnel).


5*ND* IX, p. 476.

6For a chronological summary of this entire period, see P. Coulon, P. Brasseur, _Libermann (1802-1852): Une pensée et une mystique_.


8General archives CSSp, Personnel file of M. Lairé. We give a faithful transcription of the original manuscript letter, with its errors and apologies.

9Bishop Aloyse Kobès (1820-1872).

10Charles Gay (1828-1881).

11Joseph Bourget (1817-1873).

12Jean-Claude Duret (1824-1875).

13The italicized words in brackets appear in the text but were crossed out by Lairé.

14Translation: [the missionary] “will prove himself by the distinguished characteristics of outstanding charity and prudence but also by his long use and experience of things . . .”

15Translation: “I can do everything in Him who . . .” Beginning of the citation from Phil 4: 13: Omnia possum in eo qui me confortat. I can do everything in Him who gives me strength.

16Martin Duby, born May 1, 1823 in Ammerschwir (Strasbourg diocese), entered Notre-Dame du Gard on December 11, 1847 and left for Africa with Mgr. Bessieux in February 1849. He served his apostolate in N’Dhangol, at St. Marie of The Gambia, in Dakar, and again in The Gambia. Returning to France in 1856, he twice went back to Senegambia for extended stays. He died in Chevilly May 8, 1890.


18Fr. Ignace Schwindenhammer was then Assistant General. He succeeded Libermann as Superior General of the Congregation (1853-1881).

19Translation: “by a holy kiss.”

20Ernest Briot of Mallerie, born in Loyat (Vannes diocese), June 2, 1813. In 1857, he left the Congregation and retired in Switzerland. He died around 1870.

21“In 1825 the first young Africans, boys and girls, that Mother Javouhey had brought from Senegal for training, arrived in France. Arriving in France in the spring of 1827, David Boilat, Arsène Fridoil and Jean-Pierre Moussa entered the Major Seminary of Carcassonne in 1834. Before their ordination (September 18, 1840) they spent some time at the Seminary of the Holy Spirit. . . “ cf. P. Coulon, P. Brasseur, op. cit., p. 550.

22Arch. CSSp 154-B-1


24P. Coulon, ”Faites-vous nègres avec les nègres” ou la stratégie missionnaire d’un mystique (1847),” in P. Coulon, P. Brasseur, op. cit., p. 489-546 (esp. p. 530-541). See also Christian de Mare, ed., A Spiritan Anthology. Writings of Claude François Poullart des Places (1679-1709)


28ND XIII, p. 142-146.

29Composed of four pages, two sheets front and back, on paper bearing the emblem of the Congregation of the Holy Spirit and the Immaculate Heart of Mary, this letter is registered under number 143 in Volume 1 of Copies d’autographes, p. 682-687. Microfilm of originals: reel 1, letter 143. ND XIII, p. 142-146. We adhere to the original text even in its errors.


31Matt 11:29: “Learn from me, for I am gentle and humble of heart, and you will find rest for your souls.”

32We omit the post-scripts to the letter, lines 124-133, ND XIII, p. 145-146; A Spiritan Anthology, 325-326.


34E. Germain, op.cit., p. 467-481.

35“Outside the church, no salvation.”

36Catéchisme de la Rochelle (1814), cited by E. GERMAIN, op.cit., p. 485.

37Lecuyer, “Father Libermann and the Curse of Ham,” Spiritan Papers, no. 6 (1978), 33-47.

38Partial text in A Spiritan Anthology, 376-386.

39See the article Victimale (spiritualité) by Giuseppe Manzoni in Dictionnaire de Spiritualité, t. 16 (Paris: Beauchesne, 1994), col. 531-545.