

Fall 2010

Creating a Spiritan Library

Laverna Saunders

Robert Behary

Follow this and additional works at: <https://dsc.duq.edu/spiritan-horizons>



Part of the [Catholic Studies Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Saunders, L., & Behary, R. (2010). Creating a Spiritan Library. *Spiritan Horizons*, 5 (5). Retrieved from <https://dsc.duq.edu/spiritan-horizons/vol5/iss5/12>

This Education is brought to you for free and open access by Duquesne Scholarship Collection. It has been accepted for inclusion in Spiritan Horizons by an authorized editor of Duquesne Scholarship Collection.

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

CREATING A SPIRITAN LIBRARY

Laverna Saunders,
Ed.D. &
Robert Behary, MLS.

Laverna Saunders has served as University Librarian at Duquesne University since 2002. She holds a doctorate in Educational Administration from the University of Nevada, Las Vegas; an M.A. in English Literature from Drew University; and the M.L.S. from Rutgers University. She has worked in academic libraries more than 30 years and has edited three books on the development of the virtual library.

Robert Behary has served as Reference Librarian and Systems Librarian at Duquesne University since 2003. He holds an M.B.A. from Wheeling Jesuit University and the M.L.S. from the University of Pittsburgh. He has worked in academic libraries developing Web based content for 13 years.

Luxury and refinement must be avoided in the acquisition of books. Each house, however, shall have a library in keeping with its needs.¹

In support of its Spiritan mission and identity, Duquesne University's Gumberg Library has always collected books and journals by and about the Spiritans. Over the years we have accepted donations from individuals and from other libraries, such as St. Mary's Seminary in Connecticut, for our collections. The library also has a goal of acquiring all new books by Spiritan faculty and scholars at Duquesne and elsewhere. Therefore, when Rev. Timothy J. Hickey, C.S.Sp. (then Executive Director of Mission and Identity for Duquesne University), and Rev. John Fogarty, C.S.Sp. (then Director of the Center for Spiritan Studies), asked in 2005 for assistance in creating a Spiritan library, there was no hesitation in saying yes. The concern, however, was whether to pull together print materials that would reside in Pittsburgh, or to think about the needs of a global congregation and work toward a digital library. The choice was easy, but it included locating print editions *and* developing a multi-year strategy and plan for digitization.

Books are organic objects, subject to destruction by insects, environments that are too dry or too damp, improper shelving and handling, and chemical reactions in paper and bindings. It is a challenge for libraries, even in Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, to maintain appropriate climate control for the long-term preservation of print texts. In some areas of the world, catastrophic events such as wars and major storms threaten libraries and private collections. The potential loss of print materials combined with the goal of providing 24/7 global access made a compelling case in favor of creating a digital Spiritan library.

Identification of Spiritan writings in print

The actual identification of titles to be digitized took place in several phases. The initial role of librarians at Gumberg Library was to identify Spiritan print resources spread throughout the library and bring them together in one place. Fr. John Fogarty augmented the local collection with material from the USA Eastern Province headquarters in Bethel Park. The collection at the current time consists of 1,032 book volumes representing 856 titles, seven periodical titles, and related materials written or published by or about the Spiritans.

*..the Gumberg Library
hosted the dedication of
the Fr. Edmund Supple
C.S.Sp. Room...*

In addition to organizing the print collection, the library also took responsibility for clearing and renovating an existing space to create a physical home for the print collection. The University president, Dr. Charles J. Dougherty, provided funding to furnish the room in support of the programs and scholarly work of the Center for Spiritan Studies (CSS), a joint endeavor between the Spiritan Congregation and Duquesne University. On September 5, 2006 the Gumberg Library hosted the dedication of the Fr. Edmund Supple C.S.Sp. Room and Spiritan Collection. The dedication took place during a meeting of the International Spiritan Advisory Board of the Center for Spiritan Studies.

The Fr. Edmund Supple C.S.Sp. Room and the Spiritan Collection may be used by Spiritans, Duquesne University graduate students and faculty, and by visiting scholars for the purposes of research and reading in the area of Spiritan studies. Groups may use the space for seminars on topics related to the aims of the Center for Spiritan Studies. Materials in the room circulate according to general library collection policies. However, fragile and rare items are stored in an adjoining room and are restricted to library use only.

Considerations for building a digital library

The Spiritan Collection was among the earliest ventures into digital publishing undertaken by Gumberg Library. To make content available online, the library identified five concurrent streams to develop digital content. The five streams continue to this day as development on the digital library is ongoing.

1. Select the most appropriate materials while respecting intellectual property
2. Create a Web site suitable for distributing materials
3. Partner with experts to create digital copies of materials
4. Build appropriate indexes and search functionality for the materials
5. Make the digital copies available in a variety of formats

Selecting the most appropriate materials while respecting intellectual property

In the beginning, Fr. Fogarty developed a list of important materials for digitization. Copyright laws of the United States require that before any digitization can take place, materials need to meet certain conditions, including permission from the copyright holders. Therefore, Fr. Fogarty secured a letter from the Spiritan General Superior permitting the digitization of any material for which the Congregation could claim copyright.

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

*...many important
biographies and histories
published by major
publishing houses could
not be included...*

Copyright and intellectual property concerns are becoming common throughout the world. In the early stages of the Spiritan Collection, the latest date for legally creating digital copies of materials was 1923. Because of copyright law, many important biographies and histories published by major publishing houses could not be included in the digitization project.

As copyright law continues to evolve in the age of digital publishing, authors might pay special attention to the digital publishing rights afforded by increasingly copyright savvy publishing houses. Ideally, authors would negotiate the rights to have a copy of their work included in the Spiritan Collection.

Creating the Web site

When deciding which platform to use for making digital materials available through a Web site, Gumberg Library needed to consider which tool to use. The Web platform needed to be sustainable, easy to use, and functional enough to meet the needs of a worldwide community of users. The library had the advantage of being the first digital effort undertaken by Duquesne University, so several platforms merited consideration.

The library decided first to make the documents acquired by Fr. Fogarty available via Duquesne University's content management system. Duquesne's content management system allowed users to access simple PDF files from a Web site at Gumberg Library. Before the Web site, Fr. Fogarty had filled each request by either emailing or physically mailing a compact disc to users who needed digital versions of the materials that would become the Spiritan Library.

*...the growing number
of documents in the
collection called for a
more powerful platform.*

While the simple Web site provided rudimentary access to the online collection, the growing number of documents in the collection called for a more powerful platform. Other collections, including Duquesne's Dissertations and Theses collection, needed a technology that could support very large documents, full-text searching, and similar features. The simple Web site was no longer sufficient to support the needs of users.

More and more options for digital publishing continue to emerge. Full-service digital publishing platforms range from full-service systems that control everything from the look of the Web site to the way content is stored. Other options give maximum control to site developers relying on a community of users for support. Full-service platforms are attractive because they require little or no expertise on the part of customers. However, full-

*...the Spiritan Library
needed to be moved to a
new home.*

service platforms are also the most expensive. On the other end of the spectrum is open source software which gives complete control to end users, but requires a dedicated staff of developers and programmers to create and customize every aspect of the software. While less expensive initially than the full-service option, open source options are difficult to sustain over long periods and require significant investment in personnel.

Gumberg Library selected an online platform that was neither full-service nor open source. By selecting OCLC's CONTENTdm, a product supported by the largest library software company in the world, Gumberg Library could enjoy the flexibility of open source and the support of a large sponsoring company. Gumberg Library purchased an introductory license that allowed enough space to post Fr. Fogarty's documents. The PDFs were processed using optical character recognition software, permitting full-text searching across all of the documents.

When Gumberg Library first purchased CONTENTdm in 2007, OCLC hosted the content of the Spiritan Collection on its servers in Dublin, Ohio, USA. This arrangement provided a secure and reliable way to access digital content, but was not without some drawbacks. The CONTENTdm software restricted how many items could be loaded into the Spiritan Library. The cost of storage on the hosted server proved prohibitively expensive. Once again, the Spiritan Library needed to be moved to a new home.

*...anyone in the world
with Internet access could
access the content of the
Spiritan Library.*

At Duquesne University, the Computer and Technology Services (CTS) department was busy developing expertise in a new technology called server virtualization. This allowed CTS to purchase and maintain servers at a fraction of the cost of traditional servers. Gumberg Library took advantage of the expertise at CTS and moved the CONTENTdm software to the local servers. Purchasing the fastest available storage, fiber-channel drives, insured that anyone in the world with Internet access could access the content of the Spiritan Library.

Sustainability is always a question when building a digital library. The precious digital copies in the Spiritan Collection are backed-up to Duquesne University's storage area network (SAN). The SAN creates a copy of the Spiritan Collection both within Duquesne's server room and at an off-campus backup facility.

To accommodate the growing collection, Duquesne needed an unlimited license for CONTENTdm. The President of

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

*...new graphics for each
collection interweaving
Spiritan and Duquesne
University icons...*

Duquesne University, Dr. Charles Dougherty, has always supported the effort to build the Spiritan Collection, and nowhere was his support more instrumental than providing the \$30,000 needed to purchase an unlimited CONTENTdm license.

In the summer of 2010, a graduate student from Duquesne University's Multimedia program contributed his expertise to enhance the physical appearance of the Spiritan Collection's Web site. The student created new graphics for each collection interweaving Spiritan and Duquesne University icons to create an attractive new layout.

With the unlimited license in hand, the cost of both virtual server technology and storage dropping each day, and an attractive new design, the current Web environment positions the Spiritan Collection to continue to grow for the foreseeable future. While the Web environment can now accommodate a large collection, the attention to how content is made available for the Web continued to develop as the second parallel stream.

Partner with experts to create digital copies of materials

User expectations for high-quality digital content can greatly affect the use of digital collections. If users encounter illegible, out-of-focus, or even off-center digital images, they can immediately make qualitative judgments about a site without even attempting to use the content. Fortunately, partners who understand the importance of high-quality digital images were identified early in the life of the Spiritan Collection. Fr. Fogarty began working with OCLC Preservation Services to obtain a high-quality digital version of *Notes et Documents*. Funded by a private donation, the digital version of *Notes et Documents* was available on Compact Disk by 2006.

*...partners who
understand the
importance of high-
quality digital images
were identified early...*

In 2007, Fr. Fogarty began a new project; to digitize the *Bulletin Général*. The *Bulletin Général* is a chronicle of the Spiritan Congregation from 1874-1975. Much of the material in the *Bulletin* required the special handling of seasoned digitization professionals. Fortunately, OCLC Preservation Services had worked with rare materials in the past, including such famous objects as the Gutenberg Bible. OCLC created a digital copy of the *Bulletin Général* which preserved the foldouts included in the publication, and which did not necessitate the *Bulletin Général* to be unbound prior to the scanning process.

High quality scanners used by companies such as OCLC Preservation Services are equipped with special lights that will

The 45,000 page collection included an index...

...the expectations of modern readers have changed significantly.

not expose materials to radiation that would damage brittle paper. At the same time, the scanning techniques allow for high-volume and high-quality image processing. For inexperienced scanners, creating a digital copy could destroy the original copy while taking a long time to scan. Expertise is also needed to determine the best resolution for image scanning and adjusting color settings accordingly.

One bonus feature of working with OCLC Preservation Services was that since OCLC also produces the CONTENTdm software, those responsible for creating the collection delivered the finished product directly to Duquesne's CONTENTdm server. The 45,000 page collection included an index and OCR (optical character recognition) searching approaching 80% accuracy, a very high rate.

By virtue of a grant project, the library contracted with another institution with an excellent reputation for creating digital content. Princeton Theological Seminary in Princeton, New Jersey, USA, collaborated with a regional library consortium, Lyrasis, and with an international provider of digital content, the Internet Archive, to provide subsidized scanning services to regional libraries. Quickly recognizing the opportunities, Gumberg Library pledged \$20,000 to produce digital version of even more materials from the print Spiritan Library.

Princeton proved to be an outstanding partner for digitizing many more items. Complete runs of such important documents such as *Our Province* and *Information Documentation* were among the first scanned by Princeton. Other documents from the Congregation such as the Spiritan Rule of life and the reports of General Chapters soon followed.

Build appropriate indexes and search functionality for the materials

Traditionally, the only way to access material in library collections was through an index. At times, researchers could only search the title, author, and subject of an item. For periodical literature or larger monographic sets, researchers could avail themselves of a more in-depth index. However, the expectations of modern readers have changed significantly. Access to full-text searching has become almost as important as access to the research materials themselves.

With those general principles in mind, it soon became apparent that the Spiritan Collection needed full-text search

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

*...there is a need for
more basic indexing
functionality.*

*...three levels of metadata
are available beyond the
aforementioned full-text
index.*

capabilities. Fortunately, CONTENTdm software provided a way to index all of the materials in the Spiritan Collection in full text. CONTENTdm software collects the transcripts of each digital object. For professionally scanned items, the preferred format for digital access is PDF. This format maps each page to its associated full-text, even highlighting the search words within the full text of a page.

When constructing the digital library, we enabled each collection with an individual search box feature. CONTENTdm software indexes the English, French, and Portuguese of each document, accommodating all official languages of the Congregation. Rebuilding the full-text index occurs on a periodic basis to insure inclusion of new material in the full-text index.

Still, there is a need for more basic indexing functionality. The concept of metadata standards allows for libraries around the world to share data interchangeably. While many library systems cannot accommodate full-text indexing, most rely on mature library standards to provide at least rudimentary discovery of materials.

For the Spiritan Collection, three levels of metadata are available beyond the aforementioned full-text index. First, there is the collection level. The collection level shares a single record with the world describing that Duquesne University has a collection of Spiritan materials available for searching. The library shares the collection level record with the largest international database available, WorldCat.

WorldCat also includes the second level of indexing. For each title in the Spiritan Collection, Gumberg Library creates a MARC (machine readable cataloging) record suitable for contribution to WorldCat. MARC has been used in the library community since the 1960s, and provides title, author, and subject indexing for the books and journals included in the Spiritan Collection.

The third level of metadata is known as Dublin Core. While very useful within the library community, MARC records are not flexible enough to accommodate all of the metadata contained in digital objects. Simple Dublin Core, however, can accommodate the required metadata in digital objects. While Gumberg Library does not yet share the Dublin Core metadata with the rest of the world, initiatives are underway to join larger Catholic consortia interested in sharing digitized content. For instance, Gumberg Library recently joined the Catholic Resources Research Alliance,

a group of Catholic libraries interested in promoting Catholic scholarship through the sharing of unique digital collections.

...other groups of Spiritans have neither broadband, Internet access nor modern computing equipment.

Make the digital content available in a variety of formats

The Spiritan community worldwide is extremely diverse. Many Spiritan communities enjoy access to the latest technologies including broadband Internet access, new computer equipment, and emerging mobile technologies. However, other groups of Spiritans have neither broadband, Internet access nor modern computing equipment. In fact, some communities do not have a continuous power supply.

A major challenge in creating a Spiritan collection is to accommodate all users while at the same time anticipating future needs of the Congregation. Fortunately, the seemingly diametrically opposed goals at times can prove complementary. To anticipate current and future use, the answer so far has been to take advantage of many formats.

To insure preservation of the original digital documents, Gumberg Library stores collections of archival TIFF files on numerous external devices. TIFF as a standard holds the most promise of preserving content for future generations of researchers; however, files generated in TIFF format are very large, even by modern standards. For instance, a 1 terabyte hard drive is needed to store the TIFF files for the *Bulletin Général*. Making TIFF files available online would make collections barely accessible even to users with broadband Internet access, so the best option available currently is to convert the archival TIFFs into PDF format. PDF allows users with modest connections, including ISDN, to access all of the materials in the Spiritan Collection at reasonable download speeds. To assure access to as many users as possible, CONTENTdm includes a special version of PDF for all collections. Known as PDF compound objects, CONTENTdm allows for full-text access to items without requiring users to download very large PDF files. PDF compound objects load only the pages a user needs, highlighting the full-text search results on the individual pages.

Researchers who need to copy and paste selections into their own research projects may use the full-text transcript feature...

In addition to the PDF compound objects, the metadata files for each page within CONTENTdm include a full-text transcript. Researchers who need to copy and paste selections into their own research projects may use the full-text transcript feature of CONTENTdm. The text-based full-text transcripts also hold the yet unrealized promise of accessibility for users with the slowest Internet connections.

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

*...flexibility of formats
opens new possibilities
for the future of the
Congregation.*

*...a series of video
tutorials are available
to help with basic search
mechanics for the site.*

By virtue of our partnership with Princeton University, many objects are now available in emerging formats on the Internet Archive's search pages. During the scanning process, Princeton University created files suitable for use on the newest generation of hand-held reading devices. For instance, the General Chapter documents are now available on the Internet Archive site in Kindle format, the native format required for the popular reading device the Amazon Kindle. In addition, less proprietary formats suitable for other readers including EPUB, Daisy, and DjVu are also available.

The flexibility of formats opens new possibilities for the future of the Congregation. For instance, in areas with only limited electricity, a reader might load the content of the entire Spiritan Collection onto a high capacity e-reader. E-readers are available with batteries that support up to 2 weeks of continuous reading. Other e-readers run on inexpensive AA batteries. By having the Spiritan Collection available in new publishing formats, many users without Internet access could potentially access the same scholarly content as those with broadband Internet connection.

Overview of the Current Spiritan Collection

The current online Spiritan Collection consists of nine discrete collections with materials in English, French and Portuguese. Researchers may search or browse each collection individually or as a whole. For new users, a series of video tutorials are available to help with basic search mechanics for the site.

While all collections share the umbrella of documents of interest to the Congregation, collections are divided to enhance access for researchers. Many materials are grouped because of the relative similarity of their print counterparts. Other collections consist of only one title.

The following provides a brief overview of each component part of the Spiritan Collection. The arrangement of collections may change as new material is added to the collection. Also, the basic functions may evolve according to the conventions of accessing digital collections.

Notes et Documents Relatifs à la vie et à l'Oeuvre du Vénérable François-Marie-Paul Libermann

A thirteen volume set, *Notes et Documents*, selectively documents Venerable Libermann's life from his birth through his late writings. Using materials culled from the archives of the Congregation, *Notes et Documents* contains transcribed letters,

...the *Bulletin Général*
chronicles the history
of the Spiritan
Congregation from 1857-
1975.

...Fr. Fogarty already had
digital copies of the first
twenty-two volumes of
Spiritan Papers.

narratives documenting Libermann's life, and other primary documents associated with the co-founder. The work is entirely in French.

Fr. Fogarty provided the digital version of *Notes et Documents* for inclusion in the Spiritan Collection. Fr. Fogarty derived the digital copy from the print run that Fr. Koren had collected. The full text of *Notes et Documents* was scanned using the optical character recognition software in CONTENTdm. In the spring of 2010, a graduate student working for Fr. Bernard Kelly, C.S.Sp., renumbered the collection for page number consistency.

Bulletin Général

The largest of the individual collections within the Spiritan Collection, the *Bulletin Général* chronicles the history of the Spiritan Congregation from 1857-1975. *The Bulletin Général* begins with several handwritten volumes that limit the search features of CONTENTdm. The later materials in French, English, and Latin report on Spiritan activity throughout the world.

With the financial support of the President of Duquesne University, Dr. Charles Dougherty, Fr. Fogarty worked closely with OCLC Preservation Services to produce the digital copy of the *Bulletin*. The entire set took several months to complete, but in September of 2008, the digital version of the *Bulletin Général* became available online.

Spiritan Papers

Spiritan Papers was created to "stir up renewed interest in research about our religious family."² Produced by the Generalate in Rome through the Spiritan Research and Animation Center, Spiritan Papers covers the years 1976-1988. At the beginning of the Spiritan Collection, Fr. Fogarty already had digital copies of the first twenty-two volumes of Spiritan Papers. These volumes added to CONTENTdm originally as non-searchable PDFs, but were later reloaded to enable full-text searching of the collection.

Our Province

Described as a "modest monthly letter" to promote "a greater spirit of unity and co-operation amongst us,"³ Reverend C.J. Plunkett established *Our Province* for the "American Province and its foreign missionaries."⁴ Gumberg Library held volumes 1-39 of *Our Province* and used funds from the Lyrasis grant project to digitize and load *Our Province* into CONTENTdm.

Laverna Saunders &
Robert Behary

*...a collection of 86
articles...*

*...the Spiritan Collection
has grown to the scale of a
full-fledged library...*

Spiritan Horizons

The last of the discrete collections to be added to the Spiritan Collection was *Spiritan Horizons*. PDF versions of *Spiritan Horizons* had been available on the Web site of the Center for Spiritan Studies for some time. Loading *Spiritan Horizons* into CONTENTdm added full-text search functionality to the collection. Volumes 1-3 are available through the Spiritan Collection.

Non-Discrete Collections

Three sections of the Spiritan Collection represent collections of digitized materials grouped according to genre. Spiritan Articles contains a collection of 86 articles in French, English and Portuguese. Fr. Fogarty gathered the articles for the Spiritan Articles collection from a variety of sources. The articles represent the first material to be added to the Spiritan Collection.

Spiritan Books contains full-text books either collected by Fr. Fogarty or scanned as part of the Lyrasis digitization project. The five books included in the collection are, the Birth of Missionary Spirituality, *Le Feu sur la Terre, Where are You, Life Began at Forty*, and Riaud's biography, *Claude François Poullart des Places*. Physical copies of all books still reside in the Fr. Edmund Supple C.S.Sp. Room and the Spiritan Collection at Gumberg Library.

Finally, the Congregation of the Holy Spirit collection includes 21 books. The General Chapter Documents, *l'Acte d'Union, Handbook for the Spiritan Rule of Life*, and other documents related to the Congregation are all available in this section. All of the materials were added through the Lyrasis digitization project in 2010.

Conclusion

The Spiritan Collection provides a unique opportunity for anyone wishing to access the core documents of the Congregation. Even with the limits imposed by copyright law, technology costs, and end-user accessibility, the Spiritan Collection has grown to the scale of a full-fledged library over a few years. With the continued growth of the collection, the Spiritan Community as a whole will have unprecedented access to its major documents in formats that allow for new opportunities for research, education, and personal formation.

Endnotes

¹Francis Libermann (Koren, *Essays on the Spiritan Charism and on Spiritan History*, Spiritus Press, Bethel Park, PA 1990, p. 25; N.D. 10, 560)

²*Spiritan Papers*, v.1 p. 3

³*Our Province*, v. 1, p. 9

⁴*Our Province*, v. 1, p. 10

Séan P. Kealy, C.S.Sp.

“THE HEART AND SOUL OF THE MULTITUDE OF BELIEVERS WAS ONE”

Séan P. Kealy, C.S.Sp.

Séan Kealy, an Irish Spiritan, is Professor of Biblical Studies at Duquesne University, Pittsburgh. He has lectured at Kenyatta University and St. Thomas Aquinas Seminary, in Nairobi, Kenya, and at Kimmage Mission Institute, Dublin, Ireland. He is also a widely acclaimed retreat director. A specialist in the history of interpretation of the Gospels, he is the author of many published books on Scripture and spirituality, and numerous scholarly articles. His most recent publication is *An Interpretation of the Twelve Minor Prophets of the Hebrew Bible*.

THE ACTS OF THE APOSTLES AND THE SPIRITAN MOTTO

Introduction

In composing the Acts of the Apostles, Luke has given us one of the most exciting books in the Bible. It is worth repeating E.J. Goodspeed’s comment:

Where, within eighty pages, will be found such a varied series of exciting events – trials, riots, persecutions, escapes, martyrdoms, voyages, shipwreck rescues – set in that amazing panorama of the ancient world – Jerusalem, Antioch, Philippi, Corinth, Athens, Ephesus, Rome? And with such scenery and settings – temples, courts, prisons, deserts, ships, barracks, theater”. Has any opera such variety? A bewildering range of scenes and actions (and of speeches) passes before the eye of the historian. And in all of them he sees the providential hand that has made and guided this great movement for the salvation of mankind. (Quoted in Robert Smith’s review of Krodel’s Acts in Interpretation, July 1988, p. 302).

*...has given us Spiritans
our often quoted motto
Cor Unum et Anima
Una (One heart and one
soul).*

The title of this article is a literal translation of Acts 4:32. *The heart and soul of the multitude of believers was one.* This has given us Spiritans our often quoted motto *Cor Unum et Anima Una* (One heart and one soul). An exploration of this text and its context in the Acts of the Apostles can bring to life again the spirit of the early church and the challenge this holds for today’s believers and especially for Spiritans.

Our text recalls the four “marks” of the Church, as highlighted in the Nicene Creed and expounded especially in Luke’s Acts. For Luke, according to John Carmody, et. al., *Exploring the New Testament*, (Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, 1986 p. 221):

...both assumes and forwards the notion that the Christian community has four marks that have become classical: oneness, holiness, catholicity and apostolicity. Naturally, he suggests these marks appear more clearly in Acts than in the Gospel, since the Gospel is more concerned with the second phase of salvation history, where Jesus is more